



## PERSONNEL COMMITTEE

December 7, 2018

### Minutes

The meeting was called to order at 10:13 a.m. by Governor Thompson in Rooms BC in the McGregor Memorial Conference Center. Secretary Miller called the roll. A quorum was present.

**Committee Members Present:** Governors Dunaskiss, Gaffney, Nicholson, O'Brien, and Thompson; renée hoogland, Faculty Representative and William Volz, Faculty Alternate Representative

**Committee Members Absent:** Kenan Sinan, Student Representative, Bilal Hammoud, Student Alternate Representative

**Also Present:** Governors Dunaskiss, Kelly and Trent; President Wilson; Provost Whitfield; Vice Presidents Burns, Decatur, Lessem, Lindsey, Staebler and Wright, and Secretary Miller

**ACTION:** Upon motion made by Governor Nicholson and supported by Governor Nicholson and seconded by Governor Thompson, the Minutes of the October 6, 2017 Personnel Committee Meeting were approved as submitted. The motion carried.

### AFFIRMATIVE ACTION REPORT

Vice President Louis Lessem called on Nikki Wright, Director of the Office of Equal Employment Opportunity, to present the highlights of the 2017 report, with the 2018 report to follow at a later date. The report was compiled by the office of Equbal Opportunity in conjunction with the office of General Counsel, the office of the Provost, Institutional Research, and the division of Finance and Business Operations.

The report highlighted data in the areas of employment of academic and non-academic staff, discrimination complaints, and supplier diversity. In 2017, the University employed 4,921 full time employees, 19 fewer than in 2016. White women represented 30% and minorities 41%, for 71% of the overall employee population. The minority population included Black, Asian, Hispanic, American Indian, Alaska Native, Hawaiian and Pacific Islander men and women. There were 6 more full time employees in 2015 than in 2017. Overall employee head count decreased by 6 since 2015, with women increasing by 68 and minorities decreasing by 17. The University employs 309 employees in the executive managerial categories, including deans, directors, and managers. Women comprised

53% and minorities 28% of these jobs. The 2 largest job categories are other professionals at 2,193 employees, and faculty at 1,643 employees. The University's largest group, other professionals, included accountants, certain HR professionals, assistant general counsels, and EO specialists. Women comprised 64% and minority men and women 42%. Tenure, tenure-track, and non-tenure track faculty employed at 50% of FTE or above with 32% consisting of minority men and women. Further discussion included fulltime faculty by race and gender and comparative analysis of the University's ranking for minority faculty amongst national and peer institutions with Wayne State ranking first among peers. The data was derived from the United States department of education's data collection system, IPEDS, a system of surveys conducted annually that gathers information from every federally funded institution of higher education. The University was ranked number one in minority hiring since 2012. Women comprised 42% of full time faculty, ranking the University 7<sup>th</sup> amongst similar national peers for women faculty. In 2016, the University ranked 5<sup>th</sup>. Total faculty decreased by 112 since 2013, including 11 minority faculty and an increase of women faculty by 5. Faculty by rank during 2017, there were 381 full professors. Since 2016, the number of women full professors decreased by 5, and the number of minority full professors decreased by 2. There were 351 associate professors and the number of women associate professors increased by 13 with minority associate professors decreasing by 2. There were 185 assistant professors.

Since 2016, the number of female assistant professors decreased by 8 and minority assistant professors increased by 4. The committee also discussed the breakdown of tenure and tenure track faculty by race and gender. The University is taking steps to promote diversity among faculty through OEO support of the Provost Office with respect to faculty hiring. An electronic system to automate the faculty hiring plans has been implemented. This system tracks the tenure track hiring processes, as well as encourages diverse search committees and recruitment efforts. It will take approximately three years of accumulating data to begin to measure any hiring trends and the Provost now requires that all search committees be trained to allow for open communication to discuss the University's expectations, anti-bias awareness and experiences and how to meet those challenges. OEO has trained 38 search committee members in groups and 12 more search committee trainings were scheduled.

The percentage of minority assistant professors rose from 37.98% in 2015 to 42.2 % in 2017. The percentage of minority associate professors declined from 33 to 32%. The percentage of minority full professors increased from 25.5 to 27%.

The percentage of women tenured and tenure track faculty by rank over a three year period included an increase in women associate professors from 36.9 % in 2015 to 40.7% in 2017 and a decrease in women assistant professors from 48.6 to 47.6%. The percentage of women full professors remained the same.

OEO investigates all internal and external complaints of discrimination and harassment, including those filed by outside agencies, such as the Michigan Department of Civil Rights and the Equal Employment Opportunity Commission. During 2017, OEO received 21 initial inquiries and opened 27 formal complaints. Initial inquiries are used to determine if

there is sufficient, factual support for the allegations to warrant a full investigation through the filing of a full formal complaint. Twenty-two of the 27 formal complaints were filled by outside agencies. Within the three year period, 2017 had the highest number of formal complaints, while it had the least number of initial inquiries. A breakdown of complaints filled with each school and division over the last three years was discussed. A three year comparison of complaints by category was reviewed including an increase in retaliation cases from 0 in 2016 to 4 in 2017 with no cause findings for retaliation. Sex claims increased from 0 in 2016 to 6 in 2017. The 6 sex discrimination cases investigated by OEO in 2017 by types included quid pro quo, hostile environment, and gender discrimination. In three of the hostile environment cases, a violation of the University sexual harassment policies were found and required remedial action. There were 2 gender discrimination cases with no finding of violation.

Wayne Supplier Diversity efforts were discussed, including spending with minorities and women for construction and general services over a 9 year period. For 2017, Wayne awarded just under \$162 million in services with 2.6% awarded to women owned businesses and 9.2% to minority businesses. In response to a question regarding trending with associate professors, Ms. Wright noted that yes, trends did account for people moving from one category to another. Professor Hoogland asked how homosexual and transgender people were defined. Ms. Wright noted that federal categories were followed and the report did not separate them out, but added that additional information could be requested.

Governor Gaffney asked Mr. Doherty if there are ongoing efforts to increase the 13.5% annual spending with firms headed by women, minorities, or disadvantaged people. Mr. Doherty noted that efforts were continuous and the market place was at 10%. Governor O'Brien asked if the total number of complaints by division and college warranted customized training for those departments instead of waiting for them to request it. Ms. Wright noted that it depended on the situations, and the numbers of complaints and employees relative to the size of the department.

## **UPDATE ON SUPPLIER DIVERSITY**

Kenneth Doherty, Associate Vice President for Procurement and Strategic Sourcing for the University presented on the supplier diversity program. The State of Michigan passed Proposal 2 in 2006, which became Michigan Constitution article 1 section 26. It stated that public contracting in the State of Michigan could not be awarded based upon race, sex, color, ethnicity, national origin, etc. University Policy 04-2 specific to supplier diversity predated the State Constitution change by 2 years. It stated that supplier diversity was the responsibility of the entire organization. The University tracked and reported efforts to support supplier diversity, and diversifiers in the community with the lead being the office of procurement and strategic sourcing. With the University's supplier diversity efforts limited to outreach and opportunity, language was included with all requests for proposals regarding the faculty. The office was involved in numerous diversity councils and trade fairs throughout the year and previously received several nominations and awards.


The University is a member of the Great Lakes Women's Business Council, the Asian Pacific American Chamber of Commerce and the Michigan Hispanic Chamber of Commerce and connects with diversity suppliers through those organizations. Since 2016, the University has been a member of the Council for Supplier Diversity for Professionals. Mr. Doherty has served on the Board of Directors since 2009. Members include Blue Cross Blue Shield, Cardinal Health, Delphi, Kelly Services, Fiat, Chrysler, Ford and over 25 others. The group influenced \$8 billion dollars in diversity spending. Active outreach includes attendance at the MSCC annual conference, Detroit based business fairs, and campus talks on business opportunities related to construction for the new housing on Anthony Wayne. Mr. Doherty participated with the Turners School of Construction Management to educate small, diverse and Detroit based contractors on how to succeed. The University also participated in the Pure Michigan business connect run by the State of Michigan. It received an award from the Michigan Minority Supplier Council in 2015, was nominated in 2018 as the corporation of the year and received a Great Lakes Woman's award in 2016.

Professor Volz asked if there were comparable initiatives and data retained for Detroit based suppliers. Mr. Doherty noted that the Affirmative Action Status report talked about a 7 to 8 year old Detroit based initiative and data was tracked at 15% of spend with Detroit based business. The office participated in the Detroit Economic Growth Corporation and the Chief Procurement Officers Association chaired by DTE Energy. Governor Thompson asked whether there was a breakdown by race in the minority business category. Mr. Doherty noted that aggregated data would be an all-diverse, and then a categorized diverse number and that could be put together. A significant portion might be categorized as minority versus African American, if they were already in the data base as minority.

## **ADJOURNMENT**

There being no further business, the meeting adjourned at 10:50 a.m.

Respectfully submitted,



Julie H. Miller

Secretary to the Board of Governors